

Research & Mobility 2016 – Referaggio Progetti con Commenti dei Revisori

Titolo del Progetto		Role of nuclear receptors on the inflammation and on the blood-testis barrier as a cause of infertility											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Minutoli	Letteria	GROHMANN	Ursula	10	8	5	5	28	University of Paris-Sud (Paris 11)	0	6	LS7_3	92
		CLEMENTI	Emilio Giuseppe Ignazio	9	10	5	5	29	University of Manchester	6			
		MASCOLO	Nicola Domenico	10	10	5	4	29					

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: GROHMANN Ursula

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

Infertility of men is increasing in Western countries. Varicocele does represent an important symptom often associated with male infertility but unfortunately no successful therapies exist. Prof. Minutoli is proposing a very interesting and innovative project that has a significant potential to succeed, also thanks to the collaboration with non-Italian researchers.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator has been involved in the field since a long time and will therefore greatly implement the project. The quality of her past publications is good.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

Based on the PI experience, the feasibility and fairness of this innovative project are great.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The research is highly interdisciplinary, comprising reproductive, metabolic and inflammatory issues.

Final comment

As a whole, I like very much this project. I feel, however, that the budget for teachers' mobility is too high as compared to students. I believe that this project may allow an excellent trainership for PhD students and therefore I would recommend to decrease the budget for teachers' mobility and increase that of students' mobility.

Reviewer: CLEMENTI Emilio Giuseppe Ignazio

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

the topic is of relevance as varicocele has a high prevalence. The rationale of testing the efficacy of palmitoylethanolamide is reasonable and sustained by information in the literature, well described by the researchers. The study will provide possibly mechanistic information through the use of the KO models. I would have liked a better statement of the final objective that, judging from the experimental design is on testing the therapeutic efficacy of a specific preparation of PEA.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The research team has the competence required for the study and a sound experience with PEA and inflammation

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

the project is interesting feasible and innovative, the possibility of using PEA in varicocele has never been reported and might be an interesting therapeutic option.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

the team is well built and the interdisciplinary approach proposed justified by the scope of the project.

Final comment

a well built project with a sound hypothesis, based on the available literature. The suggestion of testing micronised PEA is attractive.

Reviewer: MASCOLO Nicola Domenico

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project deals with a very interesting and actual problem of the mechanism of action of peroxisome proliferator-activated receptors involved in the control of fertility. The impact of the project on scientific community is of great potential.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator of the project is well known with excellent scientific track record and with documented experience in the field of the proposed research topics.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project is well structured and clear and the methodology proposed are adequate for the aims.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The project and its approach is quit interesting and innovative since it involves studies in vivo and in vitro. Perhaps the way the group will interact and how complimentarity will be achieved could have been stated more clearly in the project goals.

Final comment

The research project is very attractive, feasible and of high impact on scientific community. The coordinator is definetly able to direct the ivolved research group even if is not very clear who does what.

Titolo del Progetto		Signalosome Complex Activation by New Nanotherapeutic Agents in Viral and Cancer Treatment											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Sciortino	Maria Teresa	VISCA	Paolo	10	10	5	5	30	Autonoma de Madrid	0	8	LS7_3	91
		FAZIO	Vito Michele	9	9	3	4	25	Newcastle University	0			
		RANZANI	Guglielmina	10	9	4	5	28	University of Chicago	8			
									Nottingham Trent University	0			
									Sino-International Institute of Transnational Medicine at Shenzhen	0			

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: VISCA Paolo

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

This project is intended to gain insight into activation of the signalosome pathway in cancer and virus-infected cells upon treatment with novel nanostructured drugs. This topic is extremely relevant and innovative in the medical area.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The Coordinator is a renowned scientist with an excellent record of publications in the project scientific area. She succeeded to put together excellent scientists endowed with complementary expertise from highly qualified institutions to achieve the project' s goals.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The research plan is reasonably feasible within the predicted time frame. As pointed out before, the project is highly innovative and has good chances to provide important results with potential applications in the clinical practice.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

This is an absolutely interdisciplinary research which connects molecular and cell biology with nanotech chemistry and engineering. The team includes young scientists that will greatly benefit from collaboration and mobility within the project.

Final Comment

This is an excellent proposal that fully meets with the aims of the R&M 2016 call. The synergistic interaction among renowned scientists from different scientific areas and countries, all working on a same goal, has very good chances to provide successful results. I strongly recommend a financial support for this proposal.

Reviewer: FAZIO Vito Michele

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project deals with the development of drug delivery systems based on graphene nanoparticles modified with cationic beta-cyclodextrins and hyaluronic acid, designed for the controlled delivery of multiple drugs in the treatment of viral and cancer diseases. The project is based also on previous experiences of the proponents in renowned foreign research centers and provides a strong network of collaborations with the same and other laboratories around the world. The proposal is part of a line of research of product and process innovation very competitive at the international level, in which the proponents have already demonstrated competence and ability.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator has been engaged for years on this line of research, and demonstrates experience and technical/scientific publications consistent with the proposed project. Some of the collaborating centers correspond to earlier working stages of the proponent, others to centers with ongoing collaborations. The project is quite ambitious and provides for the integration of chemical technologies of nanoparticles, applications in virology and oncology through various functional molecules and miRNAs, and evaluation of different effects both mechanistic, structural and functional. It is difficult for the expert to judge so vast technologies and objectives. It is obvious that the project will need more substantial funding to carry out complex results, as comparative NGS of transcriptomes, measuring autophagosomes, transfection experiments, and so on. Some doubts about the absolute validity of the use of Human Red Blood Cells (RBCs) as model to predict the anti-proliferative effects in cancer cells.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project is quite ambitious and provides for the integration of chemical technologies of nanoparticles, applications in virology and oncology through various functional molecules and miRNAs, and evaluation of different effects both mechanistic, structural and functional. It is difficult for the expert to judge so vast technologies and objectives. It is obvious that the project will need more substantial funding to carry out complex results, as comparative NGS of transcriptomes, measuring autophagosomes, transfection experiments, and so on. Some doubts about the absolute validity of the use of Human Red Blood Cells (RBCs) as model to predict the anti-proliferative effects in cancer cells.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The project is strongly integrated among various technologies and differentiated study skills. The training project is not well detailed in the research proposal but the interdisciplinary training of PhD students can be clearly deduced from the tasks of the working program, spanning from molecular biology to organic synthesis, from the study of interactions between proteins and small molecules, to the cell biology, from nanotechnology, to the NGS and so on.

Final Comment

The proposal is a research and training project well structured and integrated, very ambitious toward multiple goals. It is based on scientific and technological cooperation with many foreign institutions of highest level with which there are already links and activities under way. The integration of different skills and technologies can provide an added value even if it requires strong coordination and step by step finalization. The financial plan is balanced, but it must be complemented by additional funds to ensure the execution of the different planned strategies and tasks. The final evaluation is clearly positive.

Reviewer: RANZANI Guglielmina

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project is innovative and relevant; results obtained by the different research groups are expected to have a broad impact enhancing scientific and technological understanding

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The PI has published quality papers demonstrating knowledge and experience that are required to coordinate the research time .

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project is extremely ambitious and not all goals will be fully achieved; however the convergence of important teams/institutions can guarantee successful results

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

This is an interdisciplinary project, integrating contributions drawn from multiple disciplines and requiring intersectoral skill complementarities

Final Comment

Mobility and research groups' interactions are mandatory to carry out the plan; accordingly, the project should be financed.

Titolo del Progetto		Cytokines in nasal secretions: a molecular classification of Allergic Rhinitis											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Pajno	Giovanni Battista	PAGGIARO	Pierluigi	9	8	3	4	24	University of Zurich	8	8	LS7_10	86
		FABBRI	Leonardo	10	10	5	5	30	University of Berlin	0			
		DE CATERINA	Raffaele	8	8	4	4	24					

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: PAGGIARO Pierluigi

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project has a strong scientific background and it represents a novelty in the measurement of a large group of allergen, cytokines and other allergic biomarkers in serum and nasal secretions. The research group includes high-quality researchers at international level, with proven direct experience in the field.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The experience of the coordinator is proven by his CV and publication history, and it represents a good background for the finalization of the project.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project seems feasible, because the expertise of the different centres in the analysis of these biologic fluids for the detection of different allergens/cytokines/mediators, etc has been demonstrated. Also the possibility to collect samples from a large group of patients with allergic rhinitis is well supported by the specific network. The limitation in the project is a clear hypothesis on how these biological characterization of the patients may improve the definition of specific phenotypes (not mentioned) and promote a better assessment and possibly management of these patients. The project includes patients with allergic rhinitis, and apart from the specific allergen(s) responsible for the symptoms induction, different potential specific phenotypes in this specific disease is not mentioned.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The network proposed includes centres of high quality in the research field of allergic diseases.

Final comment

The project is interesting from a basic point of view, mainly in terms of possibility to measure a large number of allergen/cytokines/mediators etc in biologic fluids, but the clinical relevance and the potential clinical applications are not clearly reported.

Reviewer: FABBRI Leonardo

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project addresses a clinically relevant question with state of the art methodology

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator is a top class scientist with solid scientific experience in the area of allergic rhinitis

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The amount of work involved is remarkable, but these scientists must be trusted on their optimism to perform it

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The international collaboration with scientists with different competence guarantees for the interdisciplinarity of the research

Final comment

Excellent project, I recommend funding, L.M.Fabbri.

Reviewer: DE CATERINA Raffaele

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

A sound project, with the collaboration of internationally recognized groups

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

Good scientific quality and pertinence of the research coordinator and his team.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

A feasible projet with innovative characteristis

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

A project at the interface of cytokine biology and the clinic.

Final comment

A good project, to be performed by a good team of international investigators.

Titolo del Progetto		Natural Bioactive Compounds For Prevention And Treatment Of Human Diseases											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Saija	Antonina	GROHMANN	Ursula	7	6	3	5	21	University of Reading	0	6	LS7_3	83
		CLEMENTI	Emilio Giuseppe Ignazio	8	10	4	5	27	University of Barcelona	6			
		MASCOLO	Nicola Domenico	9	10	5	5	29					

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: GROHMANN Ursula

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

Obesity is a world-wide increasing disease that can highly favors cardiovascular diseases, cancer and also type 2 diabetes. The PI proposes to monitor the effects of plant drugs in the form of innovative nanoparticles in vitro, i.e., human endothelial cells (HUVEC) and human as well mouse adipocyte cell line. The project is of interest, particularly the part related to the development of innovative nanoparticles. However, the project may generate much more interesting results if conducted in mice fed with high-fat diet, which develop obesity, atherosclerosis and also type 2 diabetes. Moreover, the mentioned plant drugs, as stated byt the PI herself, have already been shown to promote some effects in obesity and thus the use of such molecules is not so innovative, although here the Authors would like to undestand the mechanism. The collaboration with several international scientists provide a good level of internationalization.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The PI has published many articles based on testing plant drugs in in vitro systems in good journals and therefore could potentially well implement the proposed project. However, she rarely appears as first or last author in her papers.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project appears to be feasible and fair, although not too much innovative in terms of the drugs but not the nanoparticles to be tested.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The nature of research is interdisciplinary and the quality and coherence of the training project are fine

Final Comment

As stated in the part of the scientific relevance, I believe that an in vivo study could be much more relevant. Regarding the financial plan, I believe that the funds asked for points 7 and 8 may be under point 4.

Reviewer: CLEMENTI Emilio Giuseppe Ignazio

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

the topic is of relevance as obesity and associated diseases has a high prevalence and discovery of novel drugs is welcome. The natural compounds to be tested, however have been already investigated and shown to have protective effects against obesity and the mechanisms of their action have been elucidated in part. The design of novel delivery systems is innovative. I would have liked a less descriptive approach to gene and protein expression- Task 3 and task 4 appear instead well designed and fully appropriate.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

the team is qualified and has the experience to run successfully the project both in its biological and chemical parts. They have a track record of publications in the field.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

the project is feasible in the time frame of the research grant and innovative in the design of novel delivery systems, while less so in the analysis of the effects of the candidate drugs.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

the team is well built with a sound interdisciplinary approach. teaching activities are coherent and well designed.

Final Comment

A project that has some merit, with highly innovative tasks 3 and 4 while information expected from tasks 1 and 2 is already present in part in the literature. Tasks 1 and 2 would add no relevant information as to the bounty of the candidate drugs. I would have concentrated the study on tasks 3 and 4.

Reviewer: MASCOLO Nicola Domenico

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project is definitely original and based on a rational basis. The multidisciplinary joint research and the results which it seeks should allow a significant advancement of knowledge in the field of plant-derived bioactive products potentially useful to human.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator is a respected and well known pharmacologist in the field of natural products surrounded by valid collaborators.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The individual researchers appear able to perform an interesting and valuable research work.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

There is complementarity in the sense that different pathways will be explored. The project will benefit and will stimulate a mutual interaction among different areas of research. It seems indicate that different methodologies will lead to fruitful exchange.

Final Comment

The research project appears well structured and can be achievable. The methods and techniques are appropriate to the conduct of the program. The results could provide useful information for the development of novel drugs.

Titolo del Progetto		Development of advanced chemo-(bio)sensors for medical applications											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Neri	Giovanni	GANAZZOLI	Fabio	9	10	4	5	28	The Australian National University	6	6	PE4_8	94
		ROSI	Marzio	10	10	5	5	30					
		DEPERO	Laura Eleonora	10	10	5	5	30					

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: GANAZZOLI Fabio

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project is highly relevant within the most important field of biosensors for medical applications, as it can be judged by the current literature and as also shown by the cited papers. At the same time, it is not fully innovative, since in some cases it appears to involve improvements of some already existing technologies.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific quality of the scientific coordinator is certainly excellent, with a long experience and significant achievements in the proposed field of research, as attested by his publication record and his outstanding bibliometric indices. At the same time, the expertise in the research team is also very good and well chosen for the proposed research.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project is most likely feasible in view of the expertise of the research team, although many details about the novel nanomaterials to be prepared, their synthesis and implementation in real biosensors are missing from the short outline of the project.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The interdisciplinary nature of the project is very good, as attested by the fields of research of the participants. As for the training activity, it appears to be fully satisfactory, since the PhD students are expected to spend some time in the partner laboratory.

Final Comment

I feel that this is a very sound research proposal in view of the expertise and scientific achievements of the research team, in spite of the noted brevity of description of the intended activity, so that in conclusion I believe that this is a project that should definitely be funded.

Reviewer: ROSI Marzio

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project is very innovative and seems to be able to provide a good chance for future improvements in human health.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator of the project shows a very high experience in the field. The quality of his research work is very well documented, as suggested also by his scientific production, characterized by an h-index of 40 and an impressive number of citations.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project is very innovative and the working group has enough experience to reach the expected results.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The worldwide recognized multidisciplinary nature of the research performed by the working group is one of the main aspect of the project.

Final Comment

The proposed research is really very innovative and the working group and its scientific coordinator have enough experience to reach the proposed goals.

Reviewer: DEPERO Laura Eleonora

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The relevance and innovation of the project is great. The advantages of breath analysis by chemical sensor are safety, noninvasiveness, and easy accessibility. Moreover, it is potentially applicable to a direct and real-time monitoring system, and a breath sample has a less complicated sample matrix than serum or urine. In the last couple of years more then 500 international papers have been devoted to this subject.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).**Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).**

The scientific coordinator and his team are well qualified to carry on the research. In particular, the coordinator is a recognized expert in solid state gas sensors for clinical diagnosis.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The specific targets are clear and at the edge of knowledge in the field. The achievements can be easily verified at the end of the project. If it will be successful, relevant intellectual properties achievements can be foreseen.

Final Comment

Cystic fibrosis, diabetes, and kidney diseases as well as Alzheimer are serious diseases that affects a growing share of the world population. The targets of the project are quite ambitious and sufficiently specific. Even if they may not be completely achieved, important results can come out from this research.

Titolo del Progetto		Physics of Nanoparticles and Nanostructures: production, characterization, functionality and employment											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Torrise	Lorenzo	MOBILIO	Settimio	9	8	5	4	26	Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT)	10	10	PE3_4	88
		DE ANGELIS	Alessandro	8	8	5	5	26	Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic	0			
		BERNABEI	Rita	9	9	4	4	26	Charles University in Prague	0			
			Loughborough University	0									
								Institute of Plasma Physics and Laser Microfusion	0				

Reviews' Comments

Reviewer: MOBILIO Settimio

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The proposal is composed of five specific topics of research inside the unifying theme of nanoparticles and nanostructures; the relevance of these materials is really very high from a fundamental point of view as well as for their very high application interest, in many different fields. This makes the field of research on nanoparticles and nanostructure really very huge. The five topics chosen and proposed are related to the specific competences of the participants to the research and to existing collaboration with international laboratories; in all five cases they regard interesting fields. A weakness of the proposal is the lack of description of any specific system to be investigated, that makes it difficult to judge the real interest of the measurements and studies that will be performed. Strengths are the multidisciplinary and multi-technique approach foreseen, the collaborations with prestigious international institutions and the number of young researchers involved.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific activity of the coordinator of the group is quite high, he performed excellent research mainly in the field of plasma physics and their interaction with lasers, but also in medical diagnostic and radiotherapy. The coherence with the project is only partial, it is very strong with two of the topics, much less for the other three. Anyway, the team as a whole has all the competences and expertise to carry on the overall research successfully.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

Feasibility, fairness and innovation project (up to five points) No doubt on the feasibility of the research in general; the lack of details on the specific systems that will be investigated makes it difficult to judge the feasibility of the specific investigations. The fairness and the innovation are both judged positively, but again the weakness regards the lack of information on the specific system to investigate.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The research proposed is highly interdisciplinary, both experimental and theoretical methodologies are mainly physics methodologies, but the research topics and applications regard mainly biology and medicine. No detail is given on the training project; the budget foreseen for the mobility of young researchers is around 30% and is judged enough.

Final Comment

A good proposal, in an up-to-date field, with good international collaborations, highly interdisciplinary, proposed by an excellent group in the field, with few details on the specific investigations that will be carried on.

Reviewer: DE ANGELIS Alessandro

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The research has international character and the research team has an adequate level of internationalization.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The activity of the scientific coordinator is coherent with the project; his score in terms of publications is good, and rather constant during the last years. His team is adequate.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project can profit of existing expertise and instrumentation - still it is promising in terms of the innovation potential.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The subject has a high level of interdisciplinarity, touching several aspects of applied physics. The students involved can take profit of the opportunities offered by the interdisciplinary and international character.

Final Comment

A good project of applied physics in my opinion. In case there is need for a cut of the budget, I would reduce the assignment related to the travel money and to the visits of the international partners, which seem to me quite generous for a duration of one year and compared to the consistency of the group.

Reviewer: BERNABEI Rita

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project regards a hot field of applications of recently developed technologies and it has a very good international character of the research.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific quality and coherence of the scientific coordinator and of the research team on the project implementation appears very good.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project has several innovation aspects which can be feasible in the proposed time and methodology.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

the research project offers potentially many interdisciplinary aspects, and - although a number of different topics are planned to be investigated - an overall coherence is present.

Final Comment

The project refers to multidisciplinary investigations on a hot topics in recent physical technologies. Various aspects are planned to be investigated in an international environment. The required amount of money appears adequate and could offer serious possibility of success.

Titolo del Progetto		Cross-border Citizenship and Cultures: History, Law, Institutions											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Partner University	Shanghai Ranking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Pompeiano	Daniele	SAMARANI	Guido	9	10	5	5	29	Leiden University, The Netherlands		10	SH2_9	99
		VANGELISTA	Chiara	10	10	5	5	30	Columbia University	10			
		TADDIA	Irma	10	10	5	5	30					

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: SAMARANI Guido

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

-

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

-

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

-

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

-

Final Comment

This is a really valuable and innovative project, with a strong interdisciplinary approach, which aims at investigating a crucial topic, that of the deep changes in citizenship occurred in time of global transformation. I would like to express my strong support to it.

Reviewer: VANGELISTA Chiara

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

Il progetto è ben strutturato, esprime con chiarezza gli obiettivi scientifici e le fasi della ricerca. Lo stato dell'arte dà conto degli studi classici e di quelli più recenti sul tema, dando la giusta collocazione alla letteratura della Global History e dei Postcolonial Studies. Il tema è di grande attualità e rilevanza scientifica, soprattutto se, come nel caso qui presentato, esso viene affrontato tenendo conto delle continuità e discontinuità storiche (il progetto evidenzia con chiarezza i momenti e i nodi delle trasformazioni avvenute a livello internazionale durante il Novecento), della prospettiva globale - che parte dall'esame di casi inerenti tre grandi aree del mondo - e multidisciplinare (accanto al dialogo classico tra Storia e Diritto, viene qui introdotto il confronto con la prospettiva antropologica, che ritengo essenziale). Per quanto scritto precedentemente, ritengo che il progetto sia di qualità altamente innovativo.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

Considerati il curriculum e l'ampia produzione complessiva del coordinatore del progetto, nonché il riconoscimento scientifico di cui gode a livello nazionale e internazionale, ritengo che egli sia perfettamente coerente con il progetto qui presentato. Il responsabile della ricerca, per la qualità dei suoi numerosi studi precedenti, per la sua riconosciuta propensione al dialogo interdisciplinare e per la sua attenzione nella formazione di giovani studiosi, costituisce una garanzia del buon esito del progetto.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

Piano finanziario: la richiesta di finanziamento è coerente con lo sviluppo del progetto nelle sue tre fasi. Le voci relative alla mobilità di docenti e studenti di dottorato sono compatibili con l'ampio respiro internazionale della ricerca. Le voci riguardanti l'acquisto di libri e di banche dati, necessario per la ricerca specifica, sono anche il segnale della volontà di implementare il patrimonio librario e documentale dell'Ateneo coinvolto. La richiesta ridotta per le attrezzature informatiche denota la buona pratica di valorizzare le risorse, comuni e personali, già esistenti. Il piano finanziario è coerente con il progetto di coinvolgimento di almeno tre istituzioni universitarie, due europee e una americana. Si tratta di un bel progetto, inserito in un filone classico di studi e nello stesso tempo innovativo, per l'impianto concettuale e per l'approccio comparativo e multidisciplinare.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

Come detto precedentemente, il progetto è marcatamente interdisciplinare. Gli obiettivi di formazione alla ricerca e di formazione di un gruppo internazionale di studio sono coerenti.

Final Comment

Progetto di eccellenza.

Reviewer: TADDIA Irma

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The domain of Law Politics History, Institutions and the connection with globalisation has been object of many studies even recently. The relevance of the project is to connect this dynamic with the concept of citizenship in the national and international relations and link the society the the market policy. Two main points related to the state-citizenship dynamics.A new concept emerge in an epoch of post-colonial contemporary new evolution.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The team is related to many disciplines and offer a clear perception of the originality in combining social history, international politics and law and also a polical-cultural perspective.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The methodology and multidisciplinary perspective involve a vast geopolitical area. The topics will be discussed and revised according different phases and the team is linked to international partners having differen perspectives and promoting fruitful discussions.A well organized structure can conduct to original outcome.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

As already underlined, the aim of the training project is eventually that one to suggest new methodologies during the elaboration of the research and changing perspectives. A qualified team that can productively work in this direction is highly appreciated.

Final Comment

Including: -different methodologies -different geopolitical areas -different disciplines can offer further intellectual stimulus.

Titolo del Progetto		A novel approach to Urban Metabolism: integration of economic, environmental and social issues for the design of sustainable urban systems											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Ioppolo	Giuseppe	IANNUCCI	Enrica	8	8	4	5	25	University of California, Santa Barbara	6	10	SH3_1	94
		RENZI	Maria Francesca	10	10	5	5	30	University of Tokio	0			
		RAGGI	Andrea	10	10	5	4	29	Tsinghua University	0			
									University of Szczecin	0			
									Queensland University of Technology	4			

Reviewrs' Comments

Reviewer: IANNUCCI Enrica

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The research project aims is to study the urban development with an interdisciplinary and integrated approach, carrying out a model of “environmental governance”, using a novel approach to urban metabolism,the concept oriented to sustainability (SLCA; MFA-LCA). This approach it is largely a site-generic assessment tool at a global/regional scale, not location or time-specific. - The method is innovative; - The research project have an international rlevance

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator has reserch interesting coherence with the project idea. The curriculum is suitable for this work and some of his scientific publication have an international interesting.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

Objectives and timeline are clear and feasibility The seven expected results are interesting and have an international rlevance. The project proupose a new innovative approach to local strategic

planning. The details of the items cost in financial plan are fairness.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The implementation process of the project use an interdisciplinary and integrated approach (SLCA; MFA-LCA).

Final Comment

-

Reviewer: RENZI Maria Francesca

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

Il progetto affronta l'introduzione di nuovi modelli di sostenibilità a scala urbana, su sistemi urbani complessi, identificati in giga e megalopoli. Si tratta di un argomento di interesse internazionale e interdisciplinare. L'approccio integrato economico-ambientale e sociale, è innovativo. Il progetto si propone di sviluppare un nuovo modello a supporto al decisore pubblico per identificare i criteri applicativi del metabolismo sostenibile, supportato da un sistema di governance, su scala urbana. Nel progetto sono coinvolte 5 prestigiose Università internazionali (tra cui Santa Barbara, Tokyo, Tsinghua), di cui tre nello Shangai Ranking 2016 (1 in SOC, e 2 in ENG), operando sia in Europa che in Asia, Australia ed America (carattere globale). Infine i docenti stranieri coinvolti hanno un HI di assoluto prestigio (ad es. il Prof. Suh Sanwon HI –scopus 29/101) e sono Associate Editors in diverse riviste Fascia A - 13/B (Journal of Cleaner Production; International Journal of LCA; etc.) .

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

Il CS, Ricercatore nel settore 13/b5 Scienze Merceologiche, presenta un curriculum che dimostra pienamente una significativa maturità. In particolare, presenta 5 lavori censiti su Scopus citati a livello internazionale, tutti pubblicati nell'ultimo quinquennio, alcuni co-autorati con ricercatori internazionali di rilevanza. I prodotti presentati sono significativi coerenti alle tematiche del presente progetto. Il CS dimostra di aver partecipato a diversi altri progetti (coerenti con la presenta proposta) e di avere esperienza pregressa di coordinamento di progetti. Si ritiene pertanto, pienamente adeguato a gestire il gruppo di ricerca in termini di qualità scientifica ed esperienza.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

Il Piano finanziario, perfettamente coerente e congruo rispetto alla proposta progettuale e agli obiettivi che si intende raggiungere. Le spese si riferiscono a missioni/trasferte in/out (si evidenziano che le sedi internazionali sono in Giappone, Cina, Australia ed America). Prende inoltre in considerazione la partecipazione a convegni internazionali. Il piano, ben strutturato, supporta integralmente la proposta progettuale. l'investimento di 75.000€ rappresenta il Kick-off, per avviare un progetto di ricerca di respiro internazionale con ricadute strategiche di livello globale e di significativa portata innovativa.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

Il gruppo di ricerca nazionale investe i SSD SECS-S/06 per gli aspetti matematico-quantitativi del modello da sviluppare; SECS-P/07 per gli aspetti economico-gestionali; SECS-P/06 per gli aspetti economici applicati al tema dei trasporti, particolarmente significativo sia a scala urbana-locale che territoriale; SECS-P/13 per tutte le tematiche di sostenibilità ambientale e sociale, con particolare riferimento all'ecologia industriale ed al metabolismo urbano. Inoltre l'area 13 si arricchisce del SSD ING-IND/32 per tutti i temi energetici che completano gli indicatori essenziali nei processi di sviluppo urbano. Il gruppo è certamente coerente ed interdisciplinare, con una qualità di 3,49 su 2,0 (soglia di ammissibilità), che attesta la qualità scientifica dei partner. Il gruppo di ricerca internazionale è prestigioso, copre in maniera organica e razionale le grandi aree del mondo, è perfettamente integrabile perché operante specificatamente sui temi della sostenibilità, anche a scala urbana.

Final Comment

Il progetto è innovativo e ben strutturato. L'approccio metodologico è scientificamente rigoroso e adeguato agli obiettivi che si intende raggiungere. Ottimo il curriculum del CS e di tutto il gruppo di lavoro. Il piano finanziario è ben articolato e strutturato. Nel complesso si valuta molto positivamente il progetto proposto

Reviewer: RAGGI Andrea

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

This research project offers an innovative and interdisciplinary approach to the study of urban development based on the theory and the concepts of metabolism -- “urban metabolism”, indeed -- developed according to the principles of sustainability. Starting from considering the city as a kind of “organism” that exchanges material and energy flows with other systems, the project aims to provide key stakeholders with a comprehensive framework including a number of methods and tools to assess and manage urban growth and transformation on the basis of a sustainability approach. The extreme importance and international significance of the issues and problems addressed -- adequately demonstrated by the described background and the basic literature mentioned -- as well as the objectives outlined, the new perspectives adopted and the proposed interdisciplinary approach make this project extremely relevant and innovative.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator is a researcher with an extensive experience on the project issues, also proven by his publications in international journals, often in collaboration with researchers of international renown, as well as his participation in national and international projects. The research group has a significant international dimension, involving researchers from renowned universities in the field. The involved researchers' expertise and skills are well consistent with the characteristics and needs of the project.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

This project, which is proposed to take place over a period of one year, involves the following steps: i) identification of key issues; ii) model design; iii) model testing; iv) definition of actions; training activities are also provided. The project feasibility can be considered good, especially taking into account the size of the research team, while ignoring the time-share that each researcher will devote to the project. The cost items listed in the budget appear to be fair, according to the various types of expenditure shown. As indicated earlier, the project shows a good level of innovativeness.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The research team features multidisciplinary expertise, ranging from engineering and mathematics to economics and management, also involving skills related to typically interdisciplinary fields, such as environmental management and industrial ecology; all those competences are well suited to the project objectives and approach. As regards the training project, this emerges as a wide and articulated one; even

if, on the whole, it appears to be adequate, it should be better detailed.

Final Comment

Challenging and innovative sustainability-oriented project, characterized by a markedly interdisciplinary approach. The international research team features multidisciplinary expertise consistent with the project requirements and is led by an appropriate scientific coordinator. Basically adequate training program, but it may require greater detail in its description. Overall, the assessment is very good. .

Titolo del Progetto		Community Monitoring, Control And Information System: Towards A Common Maritime Zone											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Pellegrino	Francesca	LA TORRE	Umberto	10	10	5	5	30	Ghent University				88
		PACCHI	Stefania	9	9	4	4	26	University of Split				
		SARALE	Marcella	10	10	4	4	28	Universidad de Cádiz University of Oslo University of Vigo	4	4	SH3_8	

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: LA TORRE Umberto

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

L'obiettivo che il progetto intende realizzare appare particolarmente ambizioso, innovativo e di forte impatto per lo sviluppo del trasporto via mare in considerazione della carenza di un sistema di monitoraggio del traffico marittimo che possa garantire, come per il trasporto aereo, una navigazione sicura . Il progetto è molto ben articolato nelle sue varie fasi grazie anche all'integrazione delle competenze dei diversi soggetti che prendono parte all'attività di ricerca.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

Il curriculum e le pubblicazioni del coordinatore scientifico sono ottime e coerenti con il progetto da svolgere. Ottima la qualità del gruppo di ricerca tenuto conto dei risultati scientifici e della capacità di svolgere il progetto. Il carattere internazionale del gruppo avrà un impatto altamente positivo per la realizzazione del progetto.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

I risultati della ricerca apporteranno un contributo certo allo sviluppo del trasporto marittimo e saranno utili per garantire la sicurezza della navigazione marittima ed aerea. La ricerca può, infatti, fornire elementi nuovi, significativi e utili per il trasporto marittimo e rappresenterà un significativo contributo all'avanzamento delle conoscenze e delle competenze nel settore.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

La metodologia che la ricerca intende utilizzare è corretta per uno studio inter disciplinare che si propone di studiare la possibile applicazione di sistemi e procedure per la sicurezza del traffico aereo al settore del trasporto via mare. Il complesso di conoscenze elaborato dalla ricerca potrà consentire agli operatori del settore di trovare un efficace sostegno per un monitoraggio del traffico marittimo che garantisca una maggiore sicurezza della navigazione.

Final Comment

La valutazione del progetto di ricerca è ampiamente positiva, per quanto in precedenza esposto ed in particolare: perché si tratta di una proposta innovativa; perché si prevedono buone prospettive di diffusione e applicazione dei risultati attesi; perché offre un contributo all'avanzamento delle conoscenze e delle competenze nel settore interessato; perché sia il coordinatore scientifico che i singoli componenti dell'unità di ricerca garantiscono una elevata qualificazione scientifica e professionale.

Reviewer: PACCHI Stefania

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The research project is highly relevant for the comparison, on an international level, the IMO and the ICAO regulations, taking into account the Italian and EU legislation,

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

High level of quality and scientific consistency.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The investigation indicates that the project is feasible, properly set and innovative

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The project presents a good level of interdisciplinarity.

Final Comment

It is a serious and important research project that deserves attention.

Reviewer: SARALE Marcella

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project unquestionably has significant relevance from an application standpoint also in light of the innovative use of existing monitoring technologies/protocols. The international character of the project is absolutely necessary to achieve the expected results, as it appears evident in the description of the activities that the team intends to carry out, and is adequately supported by the outstanding scientific relevance of the international team involved in the project. Il progetto presenta indubbi caratteri di significativo rilievo applicativo e utilizzo particolarmente innovativo degli strumenti di rilevazione esistenti. Il carattere internazionale del progetto è imprescindibile per il conseguimento dei risultati attesi ed emerge con chiarezza nella descrizione delle attività che il team si propone di svolgere ed è adeguatamente supportato anche dalla rilevanza scientifica del team internazionale coinvolto.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific profile of the coordinator and her significant experience in this specific area of research (and in similar fields of maritime law), both from an academic perspective and from an institutional/operative standpoint, are excellent and fully satisfy the expectations for a successful completion of the project. Il profilo scientifico del coordinatore e l'esperienza maturata nell'ambito di ricerca e nei settori attigui, sia a livello accademico che a livello istituzionale/operativo risultano eccellenti e soddisfano pienamente le aspettative per il completamento del progetto.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project requires a significant activity of collection of materials and comparative analysis of regulations both at domestic and international level (as very well known by the research team). In any event the expected timeframe seems to ensure the feasibility of the two steps of the research. Il progetto richiede una rilevante attività di raccolta e confronto di materiali regolamentari locali e internazionali che è per altro ben noto al gruppo di ricerca. In ogni caso i tempi indicati paiono assicurare la fattibilità dei primi due step in cui la ricerca è articolata.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The legal, administrative/managerial, technical and technological aspects of the research project are properly supported by the various competences of the team. The economic competence may be further supplemented particularly with respect to the cost/benefit analysis of the potential proposals. Gli aspetti giuridici, amministrativi, tecnici e tecnologici della ricerca sono ben supportati dalle diverse competenze del team. Potrebbe essere ulteriormente incrementata la competenza in ambito economico soprattutto per quanto riguarda l'analisi costi e benefici delle possibili proposte.

Final Comment

The project shows characters of innovation, scientific coherence and relevance and is based on solid grounds of technical and regulatory/legal knowledge. The attempt to combine and adapt existing monitoring solutions and control systems already tested in other contexts (e.g., air transportation and road transportation) seems to have features of novelty and deserves an absolutely favorable evaluation. Il progetto presenta caratteri di innovazione, coerenza e rilevanza scientifica e si fonda su un solido apparato di conoscenze sia dal punto di vista tecnico sia dal punto di vista normativo/regolamentare. Il tentativo di coniugare soluzioni già sperimentate in altri ambiti (ad esempio quello del trasporto aereo e su strada) presenta aspetti di originalità e merita pertanto una valutazione pienamente positiva.

Titolo del Progetto		Integrity and protection of Fundamental Rights Through Public contracts											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Romeo	Anna	ANDREIS	Massimo	10	9	4	5	28	Kings College London	0	4	SH2_8	80
		CIVITARESE MATTEUCCI	Stefano	5	6	4	3	18	University of Essex	4			
		VANDELLI	Luciano	10	10	5	5	30	George Washington University	0			

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: ANDREIS Massimo

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project starts from a careful reconstruction of the connection between public contracts and risks of corruption related to supranational sources and principles that come from, transposed into Italian law.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The coordinator's curriculum shows a particular orientation towards the themes that characterize the project.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project survey lines (relevance of public contracts, corruption risks, comparison of different legal systems, processing of oppositional strategies, reflection on feasible measures) are articulated rigorously and move in a workable direction; as illustrated by the project, the survey appears concretely feasible.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The research presents a interdisciplinary character, as is shown by the formulation of its objectives and the articulated description of the project. The analysis of the strategies against corruption, the modality for involvement the operators, the possible reinforcement of the criminal sanction, the attention to the common law, in Europe and US (as well as the relationship between the organization and regulation of the state on procurement public) in addition to the rules for the application of the award criteria show the reality of the project's prospects. The presence of foreign teachers contributes to a complete view of the analysis of viable strategies.

Final Comment

The project moves from a hypothesis of work articulated and traces an evocative search path which can have great scientific interest.

Reviewer: CIVITARESE MATTEUCCI Stefano

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project aims at analysing both anticorruption strategies in general and public procurements legal discipline and practice. It is not extremely clear, though, to what extent the comparison of different legal systems will be carried out. It seems that the USA public procurement law is one of the terms of comparison while the other is either the EU as a whole or the Italian law. In brief the topic is relevant, albeit not totally innovative, but the international character of the research is not clear enough

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The team is highly qualified although it is composed exclusively by legal scholars (mainly administrative lawyers), which is not completely in tune with the declared interdisciplinary character of the research project.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

I would suggest to harmonise this criterion to the first one (innovation is listed twice). As far as I can say the project looks feasible, not tremendously innovative, and fair enough.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

I'm not sure there is a training project here, in fact I could not spot anything about this, but the project explicitly takes on the interdisciplinary challenge.

Final Comment

It is a good project all in all in which I see two (possibly amendable) weaknesses: a lack of clarity about the exact scope of the research questions and some incoherence between the interdisciplinary character of the research project and the research team.

Reviewer: VANDELLI Luciano

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

-
Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

-
Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

-
Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

-
Final Comment

Titolo del Progetto		Ruling class, cultural and political élites. Italian cases and European models between the XIX and XX centuries.											
Cognome CS	Nome CS	Cognome CDS	Nome CDS	Rilevanza Scientifica	Qualità	Fattibilità	Interd.	Tot. Review	Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Partner University	Shanghai Rancking Assegnato	Area ERC	Tot.
Novarese	Daniela	SOFIA	Francesca	7	8	2	2	19	University College London	8	10	SH2_7	78
		POLSI	Alessandro	6	8	1	4	19	Oxford	10			
		MERIGGI	Marco	10	10	5	5	30					

Reviewers' Comments

Reviewer: SOFIA Francesca

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The focus of the project - the construction of the Italian elites in the long nineteenth century in a comparative perspective - undoubtedly fills a gap in the research. However, the comparison seems completely compressed on the British model, while Italy about this time oscillates between the French model (in the first half of the century) and the German one (in the second half).

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The coordinator has an extensive experience in leadership and participation in national and international research groups. She has long studied the formation of the Sicilian elite and lately also addressed the study of the political class of the unitary state. The other participants of the research team partly compensate his main interest for the history of the institutions (which is only one aspect in the history of the formation of the elites).

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The research project focuses in particular over the rich bibliography on the subject, discussing it in an original way. However, it does not indicate the sources on which the research team intends to work. It is a crucial issue given the fragmentation of archives, particularly conspicuous in the Italian case. I think that the research will lead to the study of some case studies rather than an exhaustive search.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The research team consists of historians, jurists and political philosophers. Given the research project, it would be desirable the inclusion into the team of a social scientist, given that the project includes a training module dedicated to the methodology. In addition, the training project description is not very articulate and seems to reproduce the titles of the official teachings held at the University.

Final Comment

The research project on Italian elites in a comparative perspective will fill a gap in the historical field. However, the project has some evident gaps. In the comparison seems to favour the British world while claiming to stick to a European perspective. It does not indicate the sources on which the team will work, and it is then unclear on which bases building the data banks that the project promises to create. The training project is very general and it is not clear which methodology intend to use in the research.

Reviewer: POLSI Alessandro

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The proposed research deal with a topic well considered by scholars on political thought and by historians, even if scholars have meanwhile found hard to define what social groups can be considered as ruling class, while it is easier to focus on political and cultural elites. An approach that aims to start from elitist political debate and from the spread of institutional models throughout XIX and XX century Europe may carry to some innovative topics.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

The scientific coordinator shows a high degree of scientific qualification, coherent with the aims of the project. She could ensure a good implementation of the project.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project lacks of a clear descriptions of the tasks that the others members or sub-groups intend to deal with. There is not a clear indication of the timing that the team has scheduled. This could weaken the

capacity of the team to achieve the proposed objectives.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The project shows an interdisciplinary approach, thanks to the contribution of scholars from different disciplines. The coherence of the project with the training of phd students is high.

Final Comment

The project has a sound scientific basis. The comparative approach and the references to the movement of institutional and political models are adequate and are a promising research track. The interdisciplinary approach is also guaranteed by the interaction between scholars from different scientific areas. Facing to a topic that appears to be very extensive, the project shows some vagueness in the proposed objectives and in a lack of a scheduled timing.

Reviewer: MERIGGI Marco

Scientific and innovative relevance of the project in reference to the international characteristics of the scientific research (up to 10 points).

The project is very important, in my opinion, for two main reasons: 1) because it aims to build up a unitary synthesis , developed over a long period of time , and on the the basis of a mature comparative methodology , of a topic that much of the literature has so far dealt with in a segmented and limited way . This applies to what concerns both the territorial contexts, and the connections between the different historical “times” (the pre-unification age , the liberal age) the project addresses. Consider, in this respect, for what concerns in particular the Italian case, on the one hand the variety of pre-unification situations , on the other hand the (supposed) homogeneous unitary liberal era. 2) because it has a markedly international character, as it is clear from the abstract and from the state of the art, as well as from the composition of the research group. These kind of researches are up to date still missing, and the project really fills a gap.

Scientific quality of the SC and consistency of the research group with the project idea (up to 10 points).

Thanks to her brilliant production and the characteristics of her scientific profile, which effectively combines the history of political institutions and the history of law, also showing substantial openings in the direction of the political science , the coordinator is perfectly qualified to fulfill her task . Also the team appears adequately equipped with the different scientific skills required to accomplish the interdisciplinary research work.

Feasibility, economic adequacy and innovation of the project (up to 5 points).

The project also looks very well organized in terms of its feasibility , in relation as to the span in which it is intended to develop, as well to the size of the funding which has been asked in order to realize it.

Interdisciplinary nature of the research group, quality and coherence of the project with the proposed research (up to 5 points).

The project enhances in a convincing and very promising way perspectives, emerging from a variety of different disciplines , which , at least for what concerns the Italian scientific tradition , usually develop their own research and reflection activities in isolation , without communicating with each other . The part devoted to training is also entirely consistent with the objective pursued by the research.

Final Comment

The project deserves special attention. It is a really good example of coordination of qualified diverse skills, both at the local, the national and the international levels , in order to realize interdisciplinary research, and training in the course of it new young researchers . Of projects like this, in Italy it is felt more and more dramatically today the deficiency, compared to what is the usual standard for the Humanities in many foreign research centers.